

# Public Document Pack

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July,  
2018 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: J. Becker, D. Blakebrough, L. Brown, D. Dovey,  
D. Evans, M. Feakins, R. Harris, G. Howard, P. Murphy, M. Powell  
and A. Webb

County Councillors: P. Pavia and V. Smith attended the meeting by  
invitation of the Chair.

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

|                  |   |
|------------------|---|
| Mark Hand        | Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping |
| Philip Thomas    | Development Services Manager                |
| Andrew Jones     | Development Management Area Team Manager    |
| Robert Tranter   | Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer |
| Richard Williams | Democratic Services Officer                 |

### **APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors: A. Davies and J. Higginson

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor R. Edwards declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DC/2018/00096, as a relative lives next to the site. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting, thereon.

#### **2. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2018 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

#### **3. APPLICATION DC/2018/00096 - ERECTION OF NEW DETACHED DWELLING HOUSE. 6 CAESTORY AVENUE RAGLAN, MONMOUTHSHIRE NP15 2EH**

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement financial contribution towards affordable housing in the local area.

The Vice-Chair allowed Mr. A. Edwards, Clerk to Raglan Community Council to speak on behalf of the Community Council in respect of the application. In doing so, the following points were noted:

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

- Raglan Community Council objects on principle as it considers that the actual development is classed as back land development, not in line with any frontage of Caestory Avenue or Ethley Drive.
- The Planning Department has made reference under paragraph 5.7.1 of the report of the application. The Community Council considers that without implementing the Well-Being of Future Generations Act 2015, it will have a social impact on the loss of well-being and the loss of privacy and amenity on the existing properties in this area.
- The Community Council has concerns regarding the size and bulk of the property in relation to the existing two storey dwellings which have been developed over time. Also, the bungalows and dormer bungalows which are in close proximity to the property. The development will create an overbearing aspect to these existing dwellings.
- Paragraph 5.4.1 of the report of the application makes reference to the Juliet Balcony. This provides a loss of privacy to some of the properties on and around the plot where the window will be directly overlooking.
- The principle objection is the overbearing impact on neighbouring properties, the loss of privacy to adjoining properties and the applicant has been advised to provide information to the Highways Authority which has not yet been provided regarding a concealed entrance on a narrow bend.
- This application is in conflict with Policies H3, SD4, NE1, NP5 and MV1.

Mr. J. Pope, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- There have been 60 registered objections to the application.
- Overbearing and shadowing nature of the property to neighbouring properties due to the height, mass and bulk of the property.
- The height of the property is compared to immediate neighbouring properties and the effect on the well-being of local residents due to loss of privacy and sunlight is a concern.
- The design of the property materials are out of character with the surrounding properties.
- The risk of additional vehicles exiting and entering the property on an existing treacherous double blind bend.
- The loss of any Birch trees against the recommendation of the Tree Officer.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- Objectors are also concerned regarding some of the factual inaccuracies contradictions and misleading statements in the report of the application, namely:
  - The proposal is 8.3m high at the ridgeline. This is 1.1m higher than the next tallest in the vicinity, and not similar in ridge height as stated in the report of the application but 16% higher than the next highest. It will be 40% higher than those properties in The Willows and up to 25% higher than some properties in Caestory. It will be prominent and dominate from those houses and in between those houses.
  - The Planning Officer states that 8.3 metres is within the standard height of a two storey house. Research suggests that it's 6.1 metres to 7.1 metres.
  - The property is 16 metres in length, 11 metres wide and 8.3 metres in height. This creates a mass of 88 sq. metres of wall facing Caestory and 110 sq. metres facing Ethley Drive and the Willows. This mass is only 10 metres away from Ethley Drive and with three storeys, totally overbears, blocks light, creates privacy issues due to the elevation of the windows.
  - This proposal is four times bigger square footage than the next largest house in the vicinity. It is out of character by virtue of its size.
  - The Planning Officer's report states that it uses materials that have a design in keeping with the vicinity, e.g., the grey window frames, wooden doors, dormers and grey slate roofs. No houses in Caestory, the Willows or Ethley Drive have these features.
  - The Tree Officer stated that he would be unable to support a proposal that would remove the Birch trees. The latest plans indicate that three trees are being removed but the Planning report indicates that two trees are being removed. No further recommendations have been received from the Tree Officer.
  - The blind double bend onto which vehicles will enter and exit is dangerous adding additional traffic to the existing and proposed new dwelling. Delivery vans and people parking on the bend will only add to the risk.
  - The road is used as a walk through by all including school children and elderly people.
  - Excessive garden grabbing.
  - Misleading definitions regarding storeys of the property. 2.5 storeys were mentioned. In the report of the application, there are only two storeys mentioned.
- In short, the objections to the application are that the proposal is too high, too wide, too long, is overbearing, blocks light, affects privacy, is out of character,

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

very little similarity in design to existing properties, four times the size of neighbouring houses, destroying habitat and risk to life and serious injury due to traffic having to negotiate a double blind bend.

Having considered the report of the application, the following points were noted:

- The proposed dwelling in this location would not be acceptable. It is overbearing and over-dominant to nearby properties. The principle of building at this location is sound but not the proposed development, as outlined in the report of the application.
- The proposed development is too big for the plot.
- The proposed development does not reflect the pattern of development and the surrounding dwellings.
- There is still an issue surrounding a highways matter which could have been addressed before being presented to Committee.
- There is no drainage condition. There will be a large drive creating additional run-off.
- The proposed development would not be in keeping with the surrounding properties.
- A smaller appropriately designed property at this location would be more in keeping with the surrounding area. Negotiations with the applicant should be undertaken with a view to them coming back to Planning Committee with a revised proposal that is more appropriate for the location.
- Refusal of the application could be considered as the application was contrary to Policy DES1.
- Six of the eight Birch trees will be retained.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that we be minded to defer consideration of application DC/2018/00096 to a future meeting of Planning Committee to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to revising the application that would be more in keeping with the surrounding area.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                       |   |   |
|-----------------------|---|---|
| In favour of deferral | - | 8 |
| Against deferral      | - | 0 |
| Abstentions           | - | 4 |

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that we be minded to defer consideration of application DC/2018/00096 to a future meeting of Planning Committee to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to revising the application that would be more in keeping with the surrounding area.

#### **4. APPLICATION DM/2018/00308 - PROPOSED NEW DWELLING. 3 THE PADDOCK, CHEPSTOW, NP16 5BW**

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to Section 106 financial contribution of £29,856 for affordable housing.

The local Member for Larkfield, Chepstow attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- Local residents have considerable concerns regarding this application.
- The Chepstow Town Council Planning Committee has recommended that the application be refused.
- There is a strong perception that the application process has not been handled as effectively and efficiently as it could have been. The channels of communication between officers and objectors being the fundamental issue.
- There has been a late amendment to the application submitted on 29<sup>th</sup> June 2018. Local residents and the local Member have not had time to consider this and asked if there might be grounds to defer the application. Also whether officers could indicate whether there is a technical issue for this late application to be deemed acceptable without further consultation.
- The proposed development is inappropriate in-filling.
- The open spacious nature within the cul-de-sac has been developed with deep open gardens sweeping around the front to back. The mouth of the road has been designed with bungalows on either side to facilitate that look and draw people through the back of the cul-de-sac where the two storey properties are set.
- Having an 8 metre high new build at the mouth of the road drawn to the front of the pavement, sat adjacent to bungalows would destroy the aesthetics of the locality.
- It is unacceptable over development and out of character with the surrounding buildings.
- Welsh Government Policy Guidelines 9.3.3 supported the local Member's case.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

- Neighbours have built annexes to their properties but the infilling has been undertaken respectfully and tastefully in keeping with the local surroundings guided by strict planning conditions established by the County Council and also in line with covenants placed on properties in this area.
- There has to be consistency and parity with this application and previous applications that have been approved.
- Residents have lived in the area for 40 years and this is important as they legally bought into the locality and into a living environment that they believed could not be changed for the worse due to the strict clauses in place. The proposed development is not in keeping with the surrounding area and threatens this.
- The scale, dimensions and design are absent from the application despite repeated requests that they be properly designated.
- A topographical plan has been prepared but has not been published. There should have been a scaled plan where the new dwelling will sit on the parcel of land.
- The application refers to the flood risk and that there will be a soakaway. However, three feet below the surface is bedrock which will make it difficult for sufficient drainage to be installed.
- There is potential for some gardens to become waterlogged.
- The existing drainage system is already under considerable pressure.
- Because of the nature of the development of the footings on the property, the footpath joining the Paddocks and Warwick Close will be impacted. If this is the case, then a Section 27 Notice should be served, but this has not occurred.
- A further three car parking spaces is proposed at the front of the property bringing the total to six parking spaces. Concern was expressed that this will have a negative impact on the close.

The Head of Planning, Housing and Place Shaping responded as follows:

- There would be no requirement to have an ownership notice on the land next door to the proposed development.
- Regarding the issue relating to a change to the application, there was only one change which referred to section nine on the application form. This contains a box indicating whether the applicant is related to a member of staff or an elected Member, which has been amended to confirm that the applicant is an employee of Monmouthshire County Council. If the applicant or their close relative is someone who works closely with the Planning Department or is someone who is an officer of the Planning Department, this means Committee considers the

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

application. It has been clarified that the applicant or relative is not someone who works closely with the Planning Department or one who is an officer of the Planning Department but in any case the application is being considered by Committee so this does not change anything relating to the assessment of the application.

- The plan shown in the Planning Committee meeting has some dimensions and is drawn to scale, which is sufficient in making the application valid legally.
- The topographical survey is not a requirement to make the application valid.
- Enough information is available to properly assess the application and for a decision to be made.

Mr. D. Prosser, representing objectors, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The application is contrary to the Council's Planning Policies, namely, privacy and residential areas with a high level of privacy and amenity. Many of the local residents agree, as well as Chepstow Town Council.
- The report of the application suggests that the application is policy compliant. The objector considers that it is not. The policy is based upon detailed Planning considerations which cannot be met.
- National Government guidelines require that insensitive or inappropriate infilling should not be allowed to damage an area's character or amenity.
- Council policies seek to protect areas with high standards of privacy and spaciousness. This site falls into this category.
- When entering the street there is a six foot fence in front of the buildings. All other frontages are open. This would be replaced by a two storey high house set just behind its line and prominent in a street where nearly all of the other houses are set behind expansive open front gardens.
- The report suggests that the dwelling will maintain the front building line between numbers two and three and will follow the established building line of the street. However, this is not correct.
- It will be close to and in front of a bungalow and dominate the openness of the street being close to the highway on a curve.
- Building line is a safe concept in a generally linear street where houses are in line but not in this street. The street scene will not be preserved and the proposal will have an adverse impact on the street scene.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- In response to the privacy objection, the report suggests that the new dwelling will be 9.8 metres from the common boundary. This is a crucial consideration as the measurement has been based on an ordinance survey based plan and not a measured survey. Requests for a measured survey have been ignored.
- National guidelines look to safeguard privacy by having rear gardens 10.5 metres long. Therefore residents at number 14 will be overlooked at substandard distance by two houses.
- The relationship with the bungalow is a concern because of its massing in front of the bungalow and its relationship with the street layout.
- Approval of the application will undermine the openness, spaciousness and high levels of privacy enjoyed by local residents.
- The report of the application seeks to refute all objections but rather dismisses them with little or no arguable justification.

Mr. R, Liddell, the applicant's agent, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- There is no topographical survey. However, there is a plan based on an ordinance survey which has been properly measured on site to ensure that the perimeter of the plan was correct.
- The most important point of this application is the officer's advice that the proposal is policy compliant. The agent would not have encouraged the applicant to submit the application if he did not think that the proposal was in accordance with planning policy. There is no Planning Policy objection to the proposal. The application complies with planning policy.
- All of the points of objection are overruled as the proposal is in accordance with Planning Policy.
- Car parking – three spaces shown which complies with Planning Policy.
- Privacy – Number 14 Warwick Close is not directly behind the proposed dwelling, and the proposed house is further away than number 3 The Paddocks, the existing house, which is directly opposite number 14. Number 3 has a 5.8 metre garden and is a total of 12 metres away from number 14. The proposed dwelling has a 9.8 metre garden and there is over 20 metres distance between habitable windows to bedrooms to the first floor. The garden ground level is broadly level, with a slight slope. This can be seen by the height of the concrete blocks to the underside of the timber fence, and comparing this height to both sides of the fence, which indicates that there is little difference in the ground levels.
- Design and Character – The front elevation maintains the building line and is partly in front of number 2 and behind number 3. Design is similar to other



## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

dwellings in the area. There are other situations where there is a two storey house located next to a bungalow.

- Street Scene – There are nine houses in The Paddocks that can be extended to the side and of those, seven have provided two storey extensions. It would be wrong to describe The Paddocks now as being set out in a particularly open way.
- Highway Safety – Three car parking spaces mean that there should be no need for additional on road parking and is more than the parking spaces provided to existing dwellings.
- Footpath – The proposal will not encroach onto the footpath, unlike the existing leylandii hedge or the plants to the front garden of number 2 which encroach onto the pavement. There is no overlooking or loss of light to windows to number 2 adjacent. There are no windows facing the new dwelling.
- Conclusion – The application complies with the following policy documents: Planning Policy Wales Chapter 9, Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 – Sections 3, 5 and 8, LDP Policies S1, S4, S13, S16, S17, H1, EP1, MV1 and DES1.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The proposal is a continuation of the street scene and is stepped back.
- The height of the proposed dwelling will be lower than a nearby property.
- With regard to privacy, the Planning Department works to the dimensions of 10 metres first floor window to the boundary to give an element of privacy beyond the fence. The application property and the property behind it have side gardens rather than large rear gardens so the property behind has amenity space to the side. It is 21 metres window to window.
- The application sits within planning guidelines.
- Since the development's inception, it has remained largely intact with the street scene remaining unchanged.
- Concern was expressed regarding the extra parking provision which is excessive and is at odds with the design of other buildings. It is not the right development for the area.
- Members expressed their sympathy for the objectors but it was considered that there were no planning grounds to refuse the application.
- The proposed development reflects the line of the development around the cul-de-sac. Providing there is amenity, privacy and the visual considerations are

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

dealt with satisfactorily it would be difficult to argue against approval of the proposed development.

- A condition could be added to ensure that both the rear first floor bathroom and the landing windows are fitted with obscure glazing, in perpetuity.
- It is unfortunate that there are no clear guidelines in national planning policy, on a wellbeing basis, that gardens need to be retained and should be seen as green field sites and not brownfield sites.
- It would be helpful if the Authority could agree on a criteria relating to size of plots and size of houses / developments. The Head of Planning, Housing and Place Shaping informed the Committee that there is scope to have Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) under Policy DES1 in respect of this matter.
- With regard to drainage issues, developments need to demonstrate they have a green field run-off rate.

The local Member for Larkfield, Chepstow, summed up, as follows:

- The residents of The Paddocks and Warwick Close are not 'NIMBYs' (Not in my back yard).
- They are not against growth.
- They understand the need for more local housing.
- Potentially, if an application was submitted that was more sympathetic to the environment and the surroundings they would probably support it. However, this application is not sympathetic to the area.
- Some residents have extended or built annexes to their properties but the infilling has been kept within the local surroundings and guided by strict planning conditions.
- A neighbour's rear garden is the same size as the back garden outlined in the report of the application.
- One of the roles of an elected Members is to improve the health and social economic wellbeing of residents and the planning system must reflect that.
- Other than the applicant and the Architect, no one is in support of the application.

It was proposed by County Councillor Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2018/00308 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 financial contribution of £29,856 for affordable housing. Also, an additional condition to be added to ensure that both the

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

rear first floor bathroom and the landing windows are fitted with obscure glazing, in perpetuity.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 10 |
| Against approval | - | 2  |
| Abstentions      | - | 1  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/00308 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 financial contribution of £29,856 for affordable housing. Also, an additional condition to be added to ensure that both the rear first floor bathroom and the landing windows are fitted with obscure glazing, in perpetuity.

#### **5. APPLICATION DC/2015/00554 - CONSTRUCTION OF DETACHED DWELLING WITH PARKING AND TURNING PROVISION FOR 3 CARS ON EXISTING DOMESTIC CURTILAGE. SITE ADJACENT TO CEFN-Y-BRYN, GROSMONT, NP7 8ES**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Mr. E. Walker, objecting to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The main concern of objectors relates to road safety.
- It was considered that the highways report does not truly reflect the gravity and concerns of the Highways department.
- In both reports, the Highways Department objects to linear parking provision. The Highways report recommends that, on highways safety grounds, the application should be refused.
- The B4347 is a strategic route.
- The A465 is the main road between Abergavenny and Hereford and links North and South Wales. It has a low bridge detector at Llangua.
- Alternative routes pass the site which is located on an 'S' bend at one of the narrowest points in the road.
- The planning report states that issues regarding parking have been addressed but this is not the case. The revised layout plan is worse than the previous plan. The objector had prepared drawings to scale. The scheme is unworkable.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm**

- The previous application did not work either and revised plans had been prepared.
- Passengers would be required to get out of the car before it is parked.
- Vehicles attempting to park would require considerable manoeuvring of the vehicle potentially endangering other road users which was highlighted by the Highways Department.
- The application provides three parking spaces. The Objector considers that this application does not comply with Supplementary Guidelines.
- This application only refers to a drain and soakaway with no indication of where the water is to be discharged.
- Drainage is a major problem as the ground is mainly rock. The gradient of the site will result in water flowing directly onto the highway with potentially dangerous consequences in inclement weather.
- The objectors do not object to the house but object to the dangerous unworkable parking arrangements.

Mr. B. Spencer, the applicant's agent, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The original pre-application advice was that a scheme could be undertaken with parking off road. Following a meeting with the Head of Planning, Conservation Officer and the Planning Officer, it was agreed that the scheme would be revised to minimise the impact of the parking arrangement. Although only two spaces could be provided, it was considered adequate.
- Visibility splays -105 metres towards Grosmont centre and 56 metres in the opposite direction from the parking bay.
- The method of parking in a linear system is a reverse parking manoeuvre.
- The parking bays are 2.90 metres from the road edge with the stone wall providing ample space both sides of the vehicle.
- There are no parking restrictions in Grosmont.

Having received the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- Concern was expressed regarding the linear parking at this location and the Highways safety issues surrounding passengers alighting from the vehicle onto the highway in order to allow the vehicle to be parked.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- The Highways Department had objected to the application on highways safety grounds.
- Removal of a small section of the banking with a retaining wall to accommodate safe parking provision at this site could be considered.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that we be minded to defer consideration of the application to allow officers to negotiate with the applicant with a view to establishing a better solution to accommodate safer parking provision at the site with appropriate conditions in respect of the materials to be used, and report back to Committee.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For deferral     | - | 12 |
| Against deferral | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 1  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to defer consideration of the application to allow officers to negotiate with the applicant with a view to establishing a better solution to accommodate safer parking provision at the site with appropriate conditions in respect of the materials to be used, and report back to Committee.

#### **6. APPLICATION DC/2016/01203 - BUILD A DETACHED DWELLING ON AN EXISTING GARAGE PLOT (REVISION OF PREVIOUSLY WITHDRAWN APPLICATION DC/2015/00386). LAND AT SUNNYBANK, ABERGAVENNY**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Grofield, County Councillor S. Woodhouse, was unable to attend the meeting to speak in respect of this application. However, she had asked that her comments be noted, which were read out to the Committee, as follows:

‘Could I ask members of the Planning Committee to give serious consideration to the fact that previously this application was objected to by Monmouthshire County Council’s Highways Department on the grounds of insufficient off-street parking,

Given the very high level of on-street parking in this area, including residents from adjoining streets and the very busy Merthyr Road, nothing has changed, in fact, daily, more and more parking difficulties are being experienced in this highly populated residential area.

Therefore, I do not support this application.’

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- There are existing parking issues at this location. However, the majority of the houses in this location do not have off street parking facilities.
- The proposed dwelling differs in form and finish to surrounding properties which does not enhance or preserve the conservation area.
- Two parking spaces would be removed which would exacerbate existing parking problems in the area.
- This is a fascinating development which will not create a detrimental effect to the surrounding area. There are very few properties in the area with garages. This would be a dwelling in keeping with the surrounding properties.
- The property will comprise of clay brickwork and it is conditioned that a sample be agreed in liaison with the Heritage Officer to ensure that this will be appropriate to the conservation area. Vertical oak boarding will also be provided.
- The property is in walking distance to the train station and to the town centre.
- A condition be added to include a Construction Management Plan.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2016/01203 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report and that an additional condition be added to include a Construction Management Plan.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 11 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 2  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/01203 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report and that an additional condition be added to include a Construction Management Plan.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July,  
2018 at 2.00 pm

### **7. APPLICATION DC/2017/00444 - PROPOSED CONVERSION OF REDUNDANT AGRICULTURAL BARN TO 2 NO. DWELLINGS. NEW HOUSE FARM, LITTLE MILL, USK**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

This application was presented to Planning Committee on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2017 with a recommendation for approval subject to a Section 106 Agreement requiring a financial contribution towards affordable housing in the local area as required under LDP Policy S4. Since this time, a viability assessment has been produced to demonstrate that the development will not make a profit and therefore the contribution will not be sought.

The Council's Housing Officer has evaluated the figures and concludes that the development would be making a loss with a residual value of -£39,000.

The Head of Planning, Housing and Place Shaping informed the Committee that, at a previous meeting, a seminar will be held regarding viability studies. This matter is being addressed and details will be available in due course.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2017/00444 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 12 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 1  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2017/00444 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July,  
2018 at 2.00 pm

### 8. The following applications were considered together:

- 8.1. **APPLICATION DM/2018/00733 - AGRICULTURAL FARM BUILDING TO HOUSE FARM ANIMALS. KEMEYS HOUSE FARM CHURCH LANE KEMEYS COMMANDER USK**
- 8.2. **APPLICATION DM/2018/00817 - AGRICULTURAL FARM BUILDING HOUSING FARM ANIMALS. KEMEYS HOUSE FARM CHURCH LANE KEMEYS COMMANDER USK**
- 8.3. **APPLICATION DM/2018/00818 - AGRICULTURAL FARM BUILDING HOUSING FARM ANIMALS. KEMEYS HOUSE FARM CHURCH LANE KEMEYS COMMANDER GWEHELOG USK**

We considered the reports of the applications, and late correspondence, which were recommended for approval subject to the conditions, as outlined in the reports.

In noting the detail of the applications, it was proposed by County Councillor J. Becker and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that applications DM/2018/00733, DM/2018/00817 and DM/2018/00858 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the reports.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 12 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 1  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that applications DM/2018/00733, DM/2018/00817 and DM/2018/00858 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the reports.

### 9. APPLICATION DM/2018/00858 - FOUR BEDROOM DETACHED PROPERTY WITH INTEGRAL GARAGE. 100 HEREFORD ROAD MONMOUTH MONMOUTHSHIRE NP25 3HH

We considered the report of the application, and late correspondence, which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement requiring the following:

A commuted sum of £26,068 is required for the affordable housing financial contribution.

In doing so, the following points were noted:



## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- It is a modern design which sits well within the plot with minimal overlooking of other properties.
- However, concern was expressed by a Member of the Committee regarding the details contained within the drawings that the Committee had been provided with via the applicant's architect, as it was considered that the drawings did not accurately reflect what was being proposed.
- The Head of Planning, Housing and Place Shaping stated that a condition could be added to the application requiring details of the materials being used in this build, with samples being provided.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor G. Howard that application DM/2018/00858 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report, with an additional condition being added requiring details of the materials being used in this build, with samples being provided. Also, subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement requiring the following:

A commuted sum of £26,068.00 is required for the affordable housing financial contribution.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| For approval     | - | 11 |
| Against approval | - | 0  |
| Abstentions      | - | 2  |

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2018/00858 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report, with an additional condition being added requiring details of the materials being used in this build, with samples being provided. Also, subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement requiring the following:

A commuted sum of £26,068.00 is required for the affordable housing financial contribution.

#### **10. Design Tour - June 2018**

We received a report regarding the Design Tour that took place on Friday 8<sup>th</sup> June 2018 whereby Officers and Members visited a number of sites around Monmouthshire to consider the design and impact of recent developments.

In doing so, the following points were raised:

- The visit allowed the Committee to assess the quality and type of materials being used on developments which does affect the look of new buildings.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd July, 2018 at 2.00 pm

- There are some sites, out of County, that the Committee might wish to consider visiting, as part of the next Design Tour.

We noted the report.

#### **11. Appeal Decision - Leechpool Holdings, Portskewett**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2018. Site: 36 Leechpool Holdings, Portskewett.

The appeal had been dismissed.

#### **12. Appeal Decision - Oak Tree Farm, Devauden**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 7<sup>th</sup> June 2018. Site: Oak Tree Farm, Old Quarry Road, Devauden.

The appeal was allowed and planning permission was granted for the siting of a temporary rural workers dwelling at Oak Tree Farm, Old Quarry Road, Devauden NP16 6NS in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref DC/2016/01219, dated 21 October 2016, and the plans submitted with it, subject to the conditions set out in the annex to this decision.

#### **13. Cost Decision - Oak Tree Farm, Devauden**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to a cost decision following a hearing that had been made on 7<sup>th</sup> June 2018. Site: Oak Tree Farm, Old Quarry Road, Devauden.

The application for an award of costs was refused.

**The meeting ended at 4.25 pm.**